

# Monochromatic empty triangles in two-colored point sets

János Pach\* and Géza Tóth†  
Rényi Institute, Budapest

## Abstract

Improving a result of Aichholzer et. al., we show that there exists a constant  $c > 0$  satisfying the following condition. Any two-colored set of  $n$  points in general position in the plane has at least  $cn^{4/3}$  triples of the same color such that the triangles spanned by them contain no element of the set in their interiors.

## 1 Introduction

Let  $P$  be a set of points in the plane in *general position*, that is, assume that if no *three* elements of  $P$  are on a line. A subset of  $P$  is said to be in *convex position* if it is the vertex set of a convex polygon. According to a classical result of Erdős and Szekeres [ErSz35], for every integer  $k > 3$  there exists an  $n(k)$  such that any set  $P$  of at least  $n(k)$  points in general position in the plane has a  $k$ -element subset in convex position. For a long time it was conjectured that if  $P$  sufficiently large, then it must also contain the vertex set of an *empty* convex  $k$ -gon, that is, one that has no element of  $P$  in its interior. This statement can be easily verified for  $k \leq 5$ . In 1983, Horton [Ho83] surprised the combinatorics community by constructing arbitrarily large point sets with no empty convex *heptagon*. It took another quarter of a century to verify the conjecture for *hexagons* [Ge08, Ni07].

Some colored variants of the Erdős-Szekeres problem were considered by Devillers, Hurtado, Károlyi, and Seara [DeH03]. In particular, it is easy to see that any 2-colored point set of size *ten* in general position in the plane has a *monochromatic* triple inducing an empty triangle. It follows, for example, that any set of  $n$  points spans at least  $\lfloor (n-1)/9 \rfloor$  monochromatic empty triangles. It is not easy to see that the number of such triangles must be superlinear in  $n$ . This has been proved recently by Aichholzer, Fabila-Monroy, Flores-Penalosa, Hackl, Huemer, and Urrutia [AiF08], who established a lower bound of  $cn^{5/4}$ . Here we modify some of their ideas to obtain a somewhat better bound.

**Theorem.** *Any two-colored set of  $n$  points in general position in the plane spans at least  $cn^{4/3}$  monochromatic empty triangles, where  $c > 0$  is an absolute constant.*

A number of related questions for colored point sets are listed in [BrM05, KaKa03].

---

\*Supported by NSF grant CCF-05-14079 and grants from NSA, PSC-CUNY, Hungarian Research Foundation, and BSF.

†Supported by OTKA-K-60427.

## 2 Proof of Theorem

It is assumed throughout this note that the point set we consider is in general position. To make this note self-contained, we include the short proofs of the following two lemmas taken from the paper of Aichholzer *et al.* [AiF08].

**Order Lemma** ([AiF08]). *Let  $P_1P_2P_3$  be a triangle containing the points  $Q_1, Q_2, \dots, Q_m$  in its interior. Then the set  $\{P_1, P_2, P_3, Q_1, \dots, Q_m\}$  can be triangulated so that at least  $m + \lceil \sqrt{m} \rceil + 2$  triangles have  $P_1, P_2,$  or  $P_3$  as one of their vertices.*

**Proof.** Define a partial order  $\prec$  on points  $Q_1, Q_2, \dots, Q_m$  as follows. We say that  $Q_i \prec Q_j$  if and only if triangle  $Q_jP_1P_2$  contains  $Q_i$ . By Dilworth's theorem, there exists (i) a chain or (ii) an antichain of size  $m' = \lceil \sqrt{m} \rceil$ .

Suppose first that there is a chain of length  $m'$ . Assume without loss of generality that  $Q_1 \prec \dots \prec Q_{m'}$  is such a chain. Add all edges  $Q_iQ_{i+1}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, m' - 1$  and all edges  $Q_iP_1$ ,  $Q_iP_2$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, m'$ . Together with edge  $P_1P_2$ , now we have a triangulation of the set  $\{P_1, P_2, Q_1, \dots, Q_{m'}\}$ . Each of the remaining points  $Q_{m'+1}, \dots, Q_m$  can be connected to  $P_1$  or to  $P_2$  by an edge not crossing any of the previously selected edges. Connect those "visible" from  $P_1$  to  $P_1$ , and the others to  $P_2$ , and include the edges  $P_1P_3$ , and  $P_2P_3$ . We have obtained a set of noncrossing edges (a planar graph) such that the total degree of  $P_1$  and  $P_2$  is  $m + m' + 4$ . Extend this graph to a triangulation of the set  $\{P_1, P_2, P_3, Q_1, \dots, Q_m\}$ . At least  $m + m' + 2$  triangles have  $P_1$  or  $P_2$  as one of their vertices, so in this case we are done.

Suppose now that, for example,  $Q_1, \dots, Q_{m'}$  is an antichain of size  $m'$ . Then none of the  $\binom{m'}{2}$  lines induced by these points intersects the segment  $P_1P_2$ . Thus, all of them must cross both  $P_1P_3$  and  $P_2P_3$ . Consequently, for any  $1 \leq i < j \leq m'$ , either  $P_1P_3Q_i$  contains  $Q_j$  or  $P_1P_3Q_j$  contains  $Q_i$ . Now we can finish the argument as in the first case, except that the roles of  $P_2$  and  $P_3$  must be interchanged.  $\square$

**Discrepancy Lemma** ([AiF08]). *Any set of  $n$  blue and  $n + k$  red points in general position in the plane spans at least  $(n + k)(k - 2)/3$  monochromatic empty triangles.*

**Proof.** Let  $P$  be one of the red points. Let  $P_1, \dots, P_{n+k-1} = P_0$  denote the other red points in the order of visibility from  $P$ .

Each angle  $\langle P_iPP_{i+1} \rangle$  is smaller than  $\pi$ , with at most one possible exception,  $\langle P_0PP_1 \rangle$ , say. Therefore, the interiors of the triangles  $P_1PP_1, P_2PP_3, \dots, P_{n+k-2}PP_{n+k-1}$  are pairwise disjoint. Since at most  $n$  of them can contain a blue point, at least  $k - 2$  of them must be empty. Repeating this argument for each red point  $P$ , we obtain at least  $(n + k)(k - 2)$  empty red triangles, each of which is counted at most *three* times.  $\square$

Return now to the proof of the Theorem. Given any set  $S$  of  $r(S)$  red and  $b(S)$  blue points, define the *discrepancy* of  $S$  as

$$d(S) := |r(S) - b(S)|.$$

Let  $S$  be a two-colored set of  $n$  points in general position, and suppose, for simplicity, that  $n \geq 1000$ . We call a point  $P \in S$  *rich* if there are at least  $\sqrt[3]{n}$  empty monochromatic triangles adjacent to  $P$ . The following algorithm proves the Theorem by finding at least  $n/5$  rich points.

ALGORITHM FIND-RICH-POINTS( $S$ )

STEP 0. If  $d(S) \geq \sqrt[3]{n}/100$ , then, by the Discrepancy Lemma, we find  $\Omega(n^{4/3})$  monochromatic empty triangles. Assume that  $d(S) < \sqrt[3]{n}/100$ . It follows that  $b = b(S) > n/2 - \sqrt[3]{n}/200$  and  $r = r(S) > n/2 - \sqrt[3]{n}/200$ . Set  $i = 1$  and  $S_1 = S$ .

STEP  $i$ . It follows by induction on  $i$  that  $b(S_i) = b(S_{i-1}) - 1$ , for  $i > 1$ , so that we have  $b = b(S_i) > n/2 - \sqrt[3]{n}/200 - i$ , for all  $i \geq 1$ . Assuming that our algorithm stops before finding at least  $n/5$  rich points, we have  $i \leq n/5$ .

Take the convex hull of  $S_i$ . Remove all red points from its boundary and take the convex hull of the remaining set. Remove again all red points from the boundary and continue until we obtain a set  $S'$  whose convex hull contains only blue points. So far we have not removed any blue point, so that we have  $b(S') = b(S_i)$ . If  $d(S') \geq \sqrt[3]{n}/100$ , then STOP and observe that we are done by the Discrepancy Lemma. So we may and will assume that  $d(S') < \sqrt[3]{n}/100$ . It follows that  $r = r(S') \geq b(S') - d(S') > n/2 - 3\sqrt[3]{n}/200 - i > n/4$ . If the convex hull of  $S'$  has at least  $\sqrt[3]{n}/50$  points, remove them, and denote the resulting set by  $S''$ . Since  $d(S') \leq \sqrt[3]{n}/100$  and all points that have been removed in the last step were of the same color (blue), we have  $d(S'') \geq \sqrt[3]{n}/100$ . Taking into account that  $|S''| \geq r(S') > n/4$ , we are done by the Discrepancy Lemma, so we can STOP. Therefore, we can assume that there are  $m$  points on the boundary of the convex hull of  $S'$ , all of them blue, for some  $m \leq \sqrt[3]{n}/50$ . Let  $P_1, P_2, \dots, P_m$  denote these points, in clockwise order. Triangulate the convex hull of  $S'$  by adding the diagonals  $P_1P_j$ , for  $j = 2, \dots, m-2$ . Let  $T_j$  denote the triangle  $P_1P_{j+1}P_{j+2}$ , and let  $b_j$  and  $r_j$  be the number of blue and red points of  $S'$  lying in the interior of  $T_j$  ( $j = 1, \dots, m-2$ ).

Suppose that  $|b_j - r_j| > \sqrt[3]{n}/50$ , for some  $j$ . At least one of the regions  $T_j$ ,  $T_1 \cup T_2 \cdots \cup T_{j-1}$ , and  $T_{j+1} \cup \cdots \cup T_{m-2}$  contains at least  $(r(S') + b(S') - m)/3 \geq (2b(S') + d(S') - m)/3 = (2b(S_i) + d(S') - m)/3 \geq n/6$  points. If  $T_j$  is such a region, then we can apply the Discrepancy Lemma for the points inside  $T_j$  and we are done. If  $T_1 \cup T_2 \cdots \cup T_{j-1}$  contains at least  $n/6$  points, then either  $S' \cap (T_1 \cup T_2 \cdots \cup T_{j-1})$ , or  $S' \cap (T_1 \cup T_2 \cdots \cup T_{j-1} \cup T_j)$  has discrepancy at least  $\sqrt[3]{n}/100$ , and again we are done and we STOP.

Therefore, we can assume that  $|b_j - r_j| \leq \sqrt[3]{n}/50$ , for every  $j = 1, \dots, m-2$ . Since  $\sum_{j=1}^{m-2} b_j = b(S') - m = b(S_i) - m \geq n/4$ , there exists a  $j$  such that  $b_j \geq n/(4m) \geq 50n^{2/3}/4$  and, by our assumption,  $r_j \leq b_j + \sqrt[3]{n}/50$ . By the Order Lemma, we can triangulate the blue points in  $T_j$ , including the vertices of  $T_j$ , such that at least  $b_j + \sqrt{b_j} > b_j + 7\sqrt[3]{n}/2$  triangles are adjacent to one of the vertices of  $T_j$ . At least  $7\sqrt[3]{n}/2 - \sqrt[3]{n}/50 > 3\sqrt[3]{n}$  of these triangles does not contain a red point, and at least one-third of these empty triangles shares the same vertex of  $T_j$ , denoted by  $P$ . Thus, we have found at least  $\sqrt[3]{n}$  empty triangles incident to the same vertex  $P$ , which is therefore a RICH POINT. If  $i \geq n/5$ , then STOP. Otherwise, let  $S_{i+1} = S_i \setminus \{P\}$ , and set  $i := i + 1$ .

Summarizing: ALGORITHM FIND-RICH-POINTS( $S$ ) either stopped at STEP  $i$  for some  $i \leq n/5$ , or at STEP  $\lceil n/5 \rceil$ . In the first case, it stopped because we applied the Discrepancy Lemma to find  $\Omega(n^{4/3})$  empty monochromatic triangles. In the second case, we found at least  $n/5$  rich points, and hence at least  $n^{4/3}/15$  empty monochromatic triangles. This concludes the proof of the Theorem.  $\square$

Note that it is perfectly possible that any two-colored set of  $n$  points in general position in the plane spans at least a quadratic number of monochromatic empty triangles, that is, the lower bound  $cn^{4/3}$  in the Theorem can be replaced by  $cn^2$ , for a suitable constant  $c > 0$ . Of course, the order of magnitude of this bound would be best possible.

## References

- [AiF08] O. Aichholzer, R. Fabila-Monroy, D. Flores-Penaloza, T. Hackl, C. Huemer, and J. Urrutia, Monochromatic empty triangles, preprint, 2008.
- [BrM05] P. Brass, W. Moser, and J. Pach: *Research Problems in Discrete Geometry*, Springer, New York, 2005.
- [DeH03] O. Devillers, F. Hurtado, Gy. Károlyi, and C. Seara: Chromatic variants of the Erdős-Szekeres theorem on points in convex position, *Comput. Geom.* **26** (2003), no. 3, 193–208.
- [ErSz35] P. Erdős and G. Szekeres: A combinatorial problem in geometry, *Compositio Math.* **2** (1935), 463–470.
- [Ge08] T. Gerken: Empty convex hexagons in planar point sets, *Discrete Comput. Geom.* **39** (2008), no. 1-3, 239–272.
- [Ho83] J. D. Horton: Sets with no empty convex 7-gons, *Canad. Math. Bull.* **26** (1983), no. 4, 482–484.
- [KaKa03] A. Kaneko and M. Kano: Discrete geometry on red and blue points in the plane—a survey, in: *Discrete and Computational Geometry, Algorithms Combin.*, 25, Springer, Berlin, 2003, 551–570.
- [Ni07] C. M. Nicolás: The empty hexagon theorem, *Discrete Comput. Geom.* **38** (2007), no. 2, 389–397.